

Toolkit Workshop

Bordering

ACTIVITY

FORTRESS EUROPE

🕒 45 MIN

OBJECTIVE

Shift our understanding of borders as 'lines in the sand' to an understanding of borders as diffuse institutions present in our everyday lives.

STEP 1

Watch the short video by Ruben Andersson 'It is Time to Unfence Our View of Migration' (3 min) and answer the questions below:

<https://www.law.ox.ac.uk/research-subject-groups/centre-criminology/centreborder-criminologies/blog/2014/11/it-time-unfence>

- According to the author, what is the main role of borders and fences?
- According to the author, borders do work, but rarely in the way intended. What does this mean?
- What does it mean that we need to "unfence" our views of migration?

STEP 2

Write down some of the keywords you generally associate with the concept of "border".

STEP 3

Think about your everyday life, and write down:

- How often and in what contexts do you need a valid form of identification.
- What would you be able to access without a valid form of identification?

STEP 4

Compare the list you made in Step 2 and the list made in Step 3.

Do you see new borders emerging?

In group, discuss what is the main problem associated with understandings of borders as walls and fortresses (as in Step 1), and what forms of oppression and discrimination are made invisible through this imaginary.

ACTIVITY

EVERYDAY BORDERING

 3 H MINIMUM

OBJECTIVE

Shift our understanding of borders as 'lines in the sand' to an understanding of borders as diffuse institutions present in our everyday lives.

STEP 1

Watch the film *Everyday Borders*, dir. Orson Nava, (UK: University of East London, 2015), 55 minutes.

<https://vimeo.com/126315982>

STEP 2

As you watch, reflect on the following questions:

- What is everyday bordering?
- How do borders and bordering practices manifest in everyday life?
- Do you agree with the thesis that borders have moved from the margins of the national society to its centre?

STEP 3

Think about your own daily life: your routines, work, relationships, interactions with institutions, etc. How do borders manifest in your daily experience (as a citizen, international student, refugee, asylum seeker, migrant with or without leave to remain/residency status)?

STEP 4

Share your reflections with your class/study group. How are experiences shared in this discussion similar to and different from each other? What systems of power are operative in these experiences?

STEP 5

Collectively create a visual illustration linking experiences of everyday bordering with institutions that promote or enforce these practices. Share your illustration with people in your broader community/university to initiate an open discussion of everyday bordering.

ACTIVITY

THE LIST

 5H MINIMUM

OBJECTIVE

To think critically about the politics of the quantification of suffering and reflect on alternative possibilities for making border violence visible.

STEP 1

Find out about The List:

a database compiled by volunteers since 1993 by United for Intercultural Action, a European network of 550 anti-racist organizations in forty-eight countries. The List documents deaths of people who died while trying to reach Europe: 36,570 people at time of writing. See:

www.unitedagainstrefugeedeaths.eu

and

www.unitedagainstracism.org/campaigns/refugee-campaign/fortress-europe

Read the article by Alex Needham, "The List: The 34,361 Men, Women and Children Who Perished Trying to Reach Europe", published in The Guardian, June 20, 2018:

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/jun/20/the-list-34361-men-women-and-children-who-perished-trying-to-reach-europe-world-refugee-day>

STEP 2

Read an interview with Istanbul-based artist Banu Cennetoğlu, who over the past sixteen years has sought to put the List "out there in the world" as a "physical object" in various media, while insisting that "it is not art". See Stephan-Andreas Casdorff and Lorenz Maroldt, "The List of Banu Cennetoglu: Artist Documents the Dying of 33,293 Refugees", Der Tagesspiegel, November 9, 2017 [in German]:

www.tagesspiegel.de/politik/die-liste-von-banu-cennetoglu-kuenstlerin-dokumentiert-das-sterben-von-33-293-gefluechteten/20558658.html

and/or Charlotte Higgins, "Interview: Banu Cennetoğlu: 'As Long as I Have Resources, I Will Make The List More Visible,'" The Guardian, June 20, 2018:

www.theguardian.com/world/2018/jun/20/banu-cennetoglu-interview-turkish-artist-the-list-europe-migrant-crisis

STEP 3

Read Martina Tazzioli's short commentary, "The Politics of Counting and the Scene of Rescue: Border Deaths in the Mediterranean" *Radical Philosophy* 192: 2015, 2-6:

https://www.radicalphilosophyarchive.com/issue-files/rp192_commentary_tazzioli_politics_of_counting.pdf

STEP 4

Write a brief exposition (1 page) of Tazzioli's central argument.

What are the politics of counting?

What are the pitfalls of quantifying deaths caused by borders when trying to critique and dismantle borders?

STEP 5

Design a creative intervention (a protest) based on The List that avoids the pitfalls of the "politics of counting".

STEP 6

Present the plan of the intervention (with visuals) to your group/class.

ACTIVITY

MANIFESTO FOR A NO BORDERS POLITICS

🕒 15H PERSONAL - 5H GROUP

OBJECTIVE

To become familiar with no borders activism and literature and produce critical interventions.

STEP 1

Conduct a brief survey of literature arguing in favour of a no borders politics and describing no borders movements. Choose at least 3 (preferably 10) books and articles to read. You can choose them from the **resource list**, or find them on your own (or a combination). For each source you read, write a brief paragraph summarising the author's central argument against borders.

STEP 2

Analyse your findings: what are the main (3-10) arguments against borders that you've encountered in your literature review? Make a list. Which do you find most convincing? What counter-arguments can you imagine (not necessarily ones you agree with, but ones that proponents of borders might raise)? Drawing on your own experiences and knowledge, can you think of an argument against borders that's missing in the survey you conducted?

STEP 3

Share your findings and analysis with a working group (of 3-5 people). Combine your lists of arguments and discuss your analyses. Together, draft a Manifesto for a no borders politics.

STEP 4

Present your manifesto to the other people in your class/group. Discuss the ideas presented all together. Discuss how you can take your manifesto beyond the classroom.

ACTIVITY

LIVED EXPERIENCES OF DETENTION

🕒 15 H PERSONAL

OBJECTIVE

To develop an understanding of how the lived experiences of border violence exceeds and contests hegemonic representations.

STEP 1

Closely read Behrouz Boochani's novel *No Friend But The Mountains: Writing from Manus Prison*. Omar Tofighian, trans (Picador, 2018). A close reading involves marking up the text, keeping notes alongside, asking yourself questions for reflection and comprehension. Discussing the book with others may give you further insights.

STEP 2

Watch the film *Chauka, Please Tell Us the Time* (directed by Behrouz Boochani and Arash Kamali Sarvestani, Australia: 2017, 90 minutes).

Trailer: <https://vimeo.com/230860000>

Watch the film closely, actively, as you would closely read a text (see step 1), keeping notes, recording your reactions, questions, feelings, and thoughts. Discussing the film with others may give you further insights.

STEP 3

Research the conditions of detention in Manus Island and in other Australian offshore prisons by turning to print media, scholarly research, interviews, lectures, etc. The **resource list** offers some starting points.

STEP 4

Create a textual, visual, or auditory work that expresses how you perceive the experience of detention as described in these two works.

STEP 5

Share your work with others in your class/group. Discuss how these narratives on border violence differ and contest hegemonic representations.

RESOURCE LIST

Aderanti Adepoju, Femke van Noorloos & Annelies Zoomers, "Europe's migration agreements with migrant-sending countries in the global South: a critical review." *International Migration* 48 (3): 2010, 42-75.

Bridget Anderson, Nandita Sharma & Cynthia Wright, "Editorial: Why No Borders?" *Refuge: Canada's Journal on Refugees*, 26(2): 2009, 5-18. <https://doi.org/10.25071/1920-7336.32074>

Ruben Andersson, "It is Time to Unfence Our View of Migration," *Border Criminologies*, 2014, 3 minutes, <https://www.law.ox.ac.uk/research-subject-groups/centre-criminology/centreborder-criminologies/blog/2014/11/it-time-unfence>

Behrouz Boochani, *No Friend But the Mountains: Writing from Manus Prison*. Omar Tofighian, trans (Picador, 2018).

Behrouz Boochani, "Writing is an act of resistance." TedX Sydney, 30 July 2019, <https://youtu.be/sZCPsS5Ais0>.

Behrouz Boochani & Arash Kamali Sarvestani, dirs. *Chauka, Please Tell Us the Time* (Australia: 2017), 90 minutes.

Wendy Brown, *Walled States, Waning Sovereignty* (London: Zone Books, 2010, second edition, 2017).

Heath Cabot, "Crisis, Hot Spots, and Paper Pushers: A Reflection on Asylum in Greece." *Cultural Anthropology* 28, June 2016, www.culanth.org/fieldsights/898-crisis-hot-spots-and-paper-pushers-a-reflection-on-asylum-in-greece.

Kathryn Cassidy, Nira Yuval-Davis, Georgie Wemyss, "Intersectional Border(ing)s." *Political Geography* 66: 2018.

Heaven Crawley and Dimitris Skleparis, "Refugees, Migrants, Neither, Both: Categorical Fetishism

and the Politics of Bounding in Europe's 'Migration Crisis,'" *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* (2017), <https://dx.doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2017.1348224>.

Deanna Dadusc & Pierpaolo Mudu, "Care without Control: The Humanitarian Industrial Complex and the Criminalisation of Solidarity, *Geopolitics*, 17 April 2020, 6, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14650045.2020.1749839>.

Ida Danewid, "White Innocence in the Black Mediterranean: Hospitality and the erasure of history." *Third World Quarterly* 38(7): 2017, 1674-1689.

Nicholas De Genova, "Spectacles of Migrant 'Illegality': The Scene of Exclusion, the Obscene of Inclusion," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 36(7): 2013, 2.

Nadia El-Shaarawi & Maple Razsa, "Movements upon Movements: Refugee and Activist Struggles to Open the Balkan Route to Europe," *History and Anthropology* 30(1): 2018, 91-112, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02757206.2018.1530668>

European Commission, "Explanatory note on the 'hotspot' approach," July 2015, <http://www.statewatch.org/news/2015/jul/eu-com-hotspots.pdf>.

Paul Gilroy, *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness* (Harvard University Press, 1993).

Tanya Golash-Boza, "The immigration industrial complex: Why we enforce immigration policies destined to fail." *Sociology Compass* 3 (2): 2009, 295.

Haythem Guesmi, "Next time you see the Mediterranean." *Africa Is A Country*, 13 August 2017, <https://africasacountry.com/2017/08/next-time-you-see-the-mediterranean>.

Charles Heller & Lorenzo Pezzani, "Liquid Traces: Investigating the Deaths of Migrants at the EU's Maritime Border," *Drift* (New York: Nightboat, 2014).

Reece Jones, ed. *Open Borders: In Defense of Free Movement* (Athens: University of Georgia, 2018).
Reese Jones, *Violent Borders: Refugees and the Right to Move* (London: Verso, 2016).

Natasha King, *No Borders: The Politics of Immigration Control and Resistance* (London: Zed Books, 2016).

Naomi Klein, "Let Them Drown: The Violence of Othering in a Warming World." *London Review of Books* 38(11): 2016, <https://www.lrb.co.uk/the-paper/v38/n11/naomi-klein/let-them-drown>.

Hannah Jones, Yasmin Gunaratnam, Gargi Bhattacharyya, William Davies, Sukhwant Dhaliwal, Kirsten Forkert, Emma Jackson & Roiyah Saltus, *Go Home? The Politics of Immigration Controversies* (Manchester: University of Manchester, 2017).

Alessandro Lanni, "A political laboratory: How Spain closed the borders to refugees." *Open Migration*, 29 February 2016, <https://openmigration.org/en/analyses/a-political-laboratory-how-spain-closed-the-borders-to-refugees/>.

Jenna M. Loyd, Matt Mitchelson and Andrew BurrIDGE, *Beyond Walls and Cages: Prisons, Borders, and Global Crisis* (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 2012).

Sandro Mezzadra & Brett Neilson, *Border as Method, or, the Multiplication of Labor* (Durham & London: Duke University Press, 2013).

Violeta Moreno-Lax & Martin Lemberg-Pedersen, "Border-induced displacement: The ethical and legal implications of distance-creation through externalization." *Questions of International Law* 56: 2019.

Alison Mountz, "The enforcement archipelago: Detention, haunting, and asylum on islands." *Political Geography* 30: 2011, 119, 120.

Orson Nava, dir. *Everyday Borders* (UK, 2015), 55 minutes, <https://vimeo.com/126315982>.

Evthymios Papataxiarchis, "Being 'There': At the Front Line of the 'European Refugee Crisis'—Part One." *Anthropology Today* 32(2): 2016, 5–9

Carola Rackete, "Save Trees and Refugees." *TedX Amsterdam*, 19 December 2019, <https://youtu.be/T4dj-ZNzycl>.

Abdelmalek Sayad, *The Suffering of the Immigrant*. Pierre Bourdieu (ed), David Macey (trans) (Cambridge: Polity, 2004)

Nandita Rani Sharma, *Home Economics: Nationalism and the Making of 'Migrant Workers' in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press).

SA Smythe, "The Black Mediterranean and the Politics of Imagination." *Middle East Report* 286: 2018, 7, <https://essaysmythe.files.wordpress.com/2018/06/smythe-the-black-mediterranean-and-the-politics-of-imagination.pdf>.

Aila Spathopoulou & Anna Carastathis, "Hotspots of Resistance in a Bordered Reality." *Environment & Planning D: Society and Space*, 5 March 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0263775820906167>.

Aila Spathopoulou, Anna Carastathis & Myrto Tsilimpounidi, "'Vulnerable Refugees' and 'Voluntary Deportations': Performing the Hotspot, Embodying its Violence." *Geopolitics*, under review.

Aila Spathopoulou, "The Ferry as a Mobile Hotspot: Migrants at the Uneasy Borderlands of Greece." *Society and Space*, 15 December 2016, <https://www.societyandspace.org/articles/the-ferry-as-a-mobile-hotspot-migrants-at-the-uneasy-borderlands-of-greece>.

Martina Tazzioli, "The Politics of Counting and the Scene of Rescue: Border Deaths in the Mediterranean" *Radical Philosophy* 192: 2015, 2-6, https://www.radicalphilosophyarchive.com/issue-files/rp192_commentary_tazzioli_politics_of_counting.pdf.

Omid Toghifian, "Introducing Manus Prison theory: knowing border violence." *Globalizations*, 29 January 2020, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14747731.2020.1713547>.

Antonis Vradis, Evie Papada, Joe Painter & Anna Papoutsis, *New Borders: Hotspots and the European Border Regime* (London: Pluto Press, 2018).

Harsha Walia, *Undoing Border Imperialism* (Oakland: AK Press/Institute for Anarchist Studies, 2013).

Andreas Wimmer and Nina Glick Schiller, "Methodological Nationalism and Beyond: Nation- State Building, Migration and the Social Sciences," *Global Networks* 2, no. 4 (2002): 301–34.

Ruben Zaiotti, "Mapping remote control: The externalisation of migration management in the 21st century." In Ruben Zaiotti (ed), *Externalizing Migration Management: Europe, North America and the spread of 'remote control' practices* (London: Routledge, 2016), 3-30.